

10th Japan International Translation Competition: Classical Literature Category Review

Peter J. MacMillan

Translator of Japanese Literature, Poet

Grand Prize: Ryan Hitzman

There was great praise from the panel of judges for this piece. For me the poems were especially well translated. And I particularly liked the translation of this one:

もえ出る春ともいはずかなしきは老その森のおちばなりけり

The translator incorporated the references to teeth and leaves was very successfully in the translation:

*the season of swelling
buds, of sweet young
spring days, is gone—a bitter
sorrow grows as these leaves my
teeth fall from the old groves of Oiso*

The extensive use of knowledgeable notes showed clearly the translators knowledge and expertise in classical Japanese. The following notes were especially impressive:

⁵ The description of the wind alludes to a poem found in Episode 64 of the Tales of Ise, where the man wishes to transform himself into the wind such that he could “find a way through the gaps and go in” (*hima motometsutsu irebuki mono wo*) to the room where the woman he is pursuing lives.

⁶ The allusion here is to a certain cloistered prince that appears in Episode 78 of the Tales of Ise.

⁷ This description of autumn leaves collecting on the surface of the water derives from *Kokinshū* 303, which speaks of “weirs fashioned by the winds” (*kaze no kaketaru shigarami*).

But my personal favorites were these ones:

¹² The description of the man as “hardly able to distinguish dream from reality” derives from a pair of morning-after poems in Episode 69 of the Tales of Ise, already alluded to just before the

appearance of the robed visitor, that wonder if the previous night was “a dream or real” (yume ka utsutsu ka).

¹³ These dawn bells may derive from a famous line composed by Bai Juyi beneath Mount Lu’s Incense Burner Peak: “The bells from the Temple of Lingering Attachment—I lie on my pillow and listen” 遺愛寺鐘欹枕聽 (Baishi wenji 978). This line was included in the *Wakan roeishū*, the most important literary primer in premodern Japan, and is alluded to in the “Suma” chapter of the *Tale of Genji* and in many other poems and tales.

It is hard to imagine how the translator could have amassed such information by him or herself.

The translation of the last poem was also very successful.

かしこしと見し夜の夢は池のおもにけさ水鳥のたつにぞ有ける
that dreadful dragon beheld
in a midnight dream dissolves
in the dawn—flying up
from the pond, ducks'
wings drag on morning air

S/he has great knowledge and prowess but needs to work on making the prose of a more literary quality when translating a diary entry which is also attempting to convey an older and more elegant writing style.

Overall, highly impressive work showing great potential as a literary translator of classical prose but even more so, of poetry.

Second Prize: Ito Kinji

Though this entry was not necessarily the most accurate I felt that with a few exceptions the prose of this translation had a lovely literary quality to it making for a delightful and elegant read. For me it succeeded the most closely in conveying the tone of the original passage, which was attempting to emulate an older writing style

The Diary of Iseki Takako: Volume III (November 5, 1843 (Tenpo 14)

Passages like these felt as if they had been written in English:

But as the seasons changed, trees shed their leaves, and fallen foliage settled thickly upon the water, weaving a lattice of autumn color.

“weaving a lattice of autumn color,” is just lovely!

He shuddered at the thought, resentful of the long night ahead. As sleep eluded him, dream and waking blurred. Vivid images took hold—an immense dragon-like figure, reminiscent of those in ancient paintings, crawling along the shore. Its sheer scale defied reason. Golden scales shimmered as bolts of lightning flashed in all directions. Words like frightening felt inadequate. He trembled again and again, drenched in sweat despite the winter cold, wishing only for dawn to break.

There is a real sense of tension, drama and fear in the way this passage builds up to a climax the last phrase. Masterful work and makes of highly pleasure reading.

*A nobleman—deliberately seeking solitude—had built himself a quiet residence. He was no imperial prince famed for his love of island vistas, yet he had crafted a **broad** pond **adorned with waterfalls** and **scattered** beautiful stones throughout the grounds. The effect was subtle, refined—a landscape of quiet charm.*

This above passage can easily invoke a scene from a work such as *The Tales of Ise* and is also excellent, but the words marked in red are a little unusual and suggest non-native speaker of English usage.

The poems were not as successfully translated as the prose, and I felt that this translator’s gift was for prose rather than poetry. For prose translation the translator’s skills are formidable and accomplished. But some attention will always be needed as to natural usage in English.

Second Prize: Matthieu Felt

The third entry displayed a deep knowledge of classical references which was very impressive. There were some mistakes in the prose and a few inappropriate translations of words. The translations of the poems were not up to the standard of the prose translations and would be something for the translator to work on polishing, should he decide to become a translator of poetry. But overall, one gets the sense of the great potential of the translator of these passages, and that experience will certainly lead to even more impressive results.

第 10 回 文化庁翻訳コンクール 古典文学部門講評

翻訳家、詩人

ピーター・J・マクミラン

最優秀賞：ヒンツマン・ライアン

ヒンツマンさんの翻訳作品は審査委員から多大な賞賛を得た。私は特に和歌の訳が素晴らしいと感じ、とりわけこの訳が気に入っている。英訳には元の和歌の「歯」と「落ち葉」の掛け言葉が巧みに組み込まれているのである。

もえ出る春ともいはずかなしきは老その森のおちばなりけり

the season of swelling
buds, of sweet young
spring days, is gone—a bitter
sorrow grows as these leaves my
teeth fall from the old groves of Oiso

また、注釈部分の英訳は見識豊富であり、古典に対する専門的知識がみてとれた。

(注釈例)

⁵ The description of the wind alludes to a poem found in Episode 64 of the Tales of Ise, where the man wishes he could transform himself into the wind such that he could “find a way through the gaps and go in” (hima motometsutsu irubeki mono wo) to the room where the woman he is pursuing lives.

(風の描写は、『伊勢物語』64段の和歌を暗示している。男は風になることができれば「簾のすきまをさがし求めては入ることができるでしょうに（ひま求めつつ入るべきものを）」と思い、追い求めている女の部屋に入ることを願う。)

⁶ The allusion here is to a certain cloistered prince that appears in Episode 78 of the Tales of Ise.

(これは『伊勢物語』78段に出てくる禅師の親王を想起させる。)

⁷ This description of autumn leaves collecting on the surface of the water derives from Kokinshū 303, which speaks of “weirs fashioned by the winds” (kaze no kaketaru shigarami).

(水面に浮かぶ紅葉の描写は『古今集』303番歌に由来し、「風の作った柵（風のかけたるしがらみ）」と語る。)

私が好きな注釈はこちらである。

¹² The description of the man as “hardly able to distinguish dream from reality” derives from a pair of morning-after poems in Episode 69 of the Tales of Ise, already alluded to just before the appearance of the robed visitor, that wonder if the previous night was “a dream or real” (yume ka utsutsu ka).

(「夢と現実が判別できない」男の描写は、『伊勢物語』69段、翌朝の一対の歌に由来する。その前の、衣をまとって訪れた者がほのめかされているが、前の夜のことは果たして「夢か現実か」と問いかける。)

¹³ These dawn bells may derive from a famous line composed by Bai Juyi beneath Mount Lu’s Incense Burner Peak: “The bells from the Temple of Lingering Attachment—I lie on my pillow and listen” 遺愛寺鐘欹枕聽 (Baishi wenji 978). This line was included in the Wakan roeishū, the most important literary primer in premodern Japan, and is alluded to in the “Suma” chapter of the Tale of Genji and in many other poems and tales.

(この暁の鐘は、白居易が廬山の香炉峰のもとで詠んだ有名な漢詩「遺愛寺の鐘枕を欹てて聴く」(「遺愛寺鐘欹枕聽」白氏文集978)に由来している可能性がある。この漢詩は前近代における最も重要な文学書『和漢朗詠集』に収められ、『源氏物語』須磨の巻をはじめ多くの詩歌や物語で引用されている。)

これほどの情報を翻訳者自身がいかにして収集したかは想像しがたい。
最後の和歌の翻訳も見事である。

かしこしと見し夜の夢は池のおもにけさ水鳥のたつにぞありける

that dreadful dragon beheld
in a midnight dream dissolves
in the dawn—flying up
from the pond, ducks'
wings drag on morning air

ヒンツマンさんは豊富な知識と高い力量を兼ね備えているが、古風で優雅な文体も表そうとする日記文を翻訳するときは散文の文学的な質をさらに高める必要がある。

だが全体的に見れば古典文学の翻訳者として優れた資質を持っており、特に和歌翻訳の力量が際立っていた。

優秀賞：伊藤欣司

伊藤さんの翻訳は必ずしもすべてが正確であるとは言えなかつたが、数か所を除き、散文は美しい文学的な質を備えていて、読後感は心地よく楽しいものであった。原文のトーンを伝えるため、古典の文体になるべく近づけようと試みた点がうまくいっていると感じた。

下巻（1843年11月5日（天保14年）において、次のような翻訳は日記がもともと英語で書かれたものではないかと思わせるほどであった。

But as the seasons changed, trees shed their leaves, and fallen foliage settled thickly upon the water, weaving a lattice of autumn color.

(原文) 吹かはりつる木枯いみじう、ふりおつる木ノ葉に水の面は紅葉のしがらみをかけ...

weaving a lattice of autumn color という表現は素晴らしい。

また別の例をあげたい。この訳文は緊張感、ドラマ性、不安を生き生きと高めていき、それが最後の語句で最高潮に達する。読むのが楽しくなる優れた翻訳だ。

He shuddered at the thought, resentful of the long night ahead. As sleep eluded him, dream and waking blurred. Vivid images took hold—an immense dragon-like figure, reminiscent of those in ancient paintings, crawling along the shore. Its sheer scale defied reason. Golden scales shimmered as bolts of lightning flashed in all directions. Words like frightening felt inadequate. He trembled again and again, drenched in sweat despite the winter cold, wishing only for dawn to break.

(原文) とすゞろにむくつけう打わなゝかれ給ひつゝ、猶ながき夜をかこち給

いめ みゆ たつ
ふには夢うつゝわきがたう御心より見るわざなめり、画に書たる龍のかたちし
たけ
て其丈はかりがたう、目もみ合せがたきが池のほとりにはひわたれば、鱗は
こんじき も
金色の如かゞよひ、いなびかり四方にひらめきておそろしなどいはむは中々な
あせ
るにあまた度おびえ給ひつゝ、さばかり寒き冬の夜に御汗もしとゝになりて、
あけ
とく夜の明よかしとおぼすに、

次の例は『伊勢物語』のような作品を想起させ素晴らしいが、赤字部分は少し不自然で、非母語話者による英語の用法が見受けられる。

A nobleman—deliberately seeking solitude—had built himself a quiet residence. He was no imperial prince famed for his love of island vistas, yet he had crafted a **broad** pond **adorned with waterfalls** and **scattered** beautiful stones throughout the grounds. The effect was subtle, refined—a landscape of quiet charm.

この
(原文) あるやごとなき人わざと静なるわたりをしめて住給ふ。かの嶋好み給
み たき おと ひろ
ふ皇子ならねど滝など落しけけ池の心広う作らせ、をかしき岩どもあまたたて
させ、大方の様つきづきしう見所ありてしなさせ給ひしも

和歌は散文ほどには優れた訳とは言えず、伊藤さんの才能は和歌よりも散文にあると思われる。散文翻訳については圧倒的に熟達した技量をもっているが、英語の自然な用法には今後も常に注意を払うべきだろう。

優秀賞：マシュー・フェルト

フェルトさんの翻訳は古典についての深い知識を擁したもので、みごとであった。ただ散文にはいくつかの誤りが見られ、適切でない訳語もあった。和歌の翻訳は散文のレベルにまで達していないので、詩歌の翻訳家を目指すならば、今後さらに磨きをかける必要がある。しかし全般的に翻訳家としての大きなポテンシャルを持っており、

今後経験を積むことでさらに優れた成果を上げることが期待できる。